

critical
Infrastructure
lab



standards

people + planet

profit + capital

geopolitics

environment

infrastructures



Treco
END OF
PRINT
Mika
Diana
Katie
Katherine
James
Katie
Katie





Sanctions and Infrastructural Ideologies


Assessing the Material Shaping of EU Digital Sovereignty in
Response to the War in Ukraine

TL;DR

- EU sanctions against Russian entities are inconsistently implemented across the EU member states;
- For the European Commission this might be a breakthrough for its digital sovereignty agenda because the Council and the Commission were aligned in establishing a digital sovereignty policy that combines economic sanctions and battling misinformation;
- Multistakeholder internet governance functions as an ideological state apparatus, guided by an infrastructural ideology, to increase global connectivity on the interconnection layer;
- The EU functions as an emerging repressive state apparatus by inscribing its norms, through its territorial power, in a part of the global network of networks, but only does so within its borders and on the content layer;
- A global ideological state apparatus increases interconnection while repressive state apparatuses inscribe their regional norms in a process of metagovernance of internet governance.

interdisciplinarity at work

- Niels ten Oever - critical infrastructure lab - University of Amsterdam
- Clement Perarnaud - Brussels School of Governance - Vrije Universiteit Brussel -
- John Kristoff - University of Illinois Chicago
- Moritz Müller - SIDN Labs and University of Twente
- Max Resing - University of Twente
- Arturo Filasto - OONI
- Chris Kanich - University of Illinois Chicago

A night-time photograph of a city skyline with illuminated billboards and signs. The signs include logos for Burger King, Pacific Drome, Tommy Hilfe, and others. The text is overlaid on the image in a white, serif font.

How do sanctions aimed at Internet infrastructure align with the EU's approach to Internet governance and its digital sovereignty aspirations?

Methodology (1)

- Network measurements

- We used vantage points from the following networks:

- RIPE Atlas
- EduVPN
- Dataplane.org
- NLNOG RING
- OONI

- We measured for:

- reachability (ICMP, TCP, and UDP traceroute probes)
- Domain Name System (DNS) response (A and AAAA DNS queries over UDP transport)
- Transport Layer Security (TLS) handshake (Handshake to the IP addresses associated with port 443 on the targets and perform TLS certificate verification)
- Hypertext Transfer Protocol (HTTP) connection. (HTTP GET request for the / resource. We issue requests over both HTTP (80) and HTTPS (443) where applicable.)

Methodology (2)

Sanctioned organisation	Hostname	Source	Remark/Date added
Russia Today English	www.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Russia Today UK	www.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Russia Today Germany	de.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	deutsch.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Russia Today France	francais.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	fr.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
RT en español	actualidad.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	actualidad-rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Sputnik	www.sputniknews.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputniknewslv.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputniknews.gr	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputniknews.cn	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	radiosputnik.ria.ru	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputnikglobe.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	Registered 29 March 2023, sputniknews.com now redirects to this domain name.
Rossiya RTR / RTR Planeta	www.rtr-planeta.com	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
	rtr-planeta.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
	vgtrk.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
Rossiya 24 / Russia 24	www.vesti.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
TV Centre International	www.tvc.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
	tvci.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
NTV/NTV Mir	ntv.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
Rossiya 1	smotrim.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
REN TV	ren.tv	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
Pervyi Kanal	1tv.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
RT Arabic	www.rtarabic.com	Council Decision 2023/434 [13]	25 February 2023
Sputnik Arabic	sputnikarabic.ae	Council Decision 2023/434 [13]	25 February 2023
RT en español mirror	esrt.online	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 8 April 2022
	esrt.press	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 8 April 2022
RT Germany mirror	rtde.site	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 5 March 2022
	rtde.xyz	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 5 March 2022
	rtde.team	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 5 March 2022
	test.rtde.live	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.live	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 6 April 2022
	test.rtde.website	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.tech	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.world	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.me	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 6 April 2022
A-Russia	a-russia.ru	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Russian TV streaming site
WWITV: World Wide Internet TV	wwitv.com	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
glaz.tv	www.glaz.tv	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Russisches Fernsehen	www.russisches-tv-fernsehen.de	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
On TV Time	ontvtime.tv	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
SPB TV World	spbv.online	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Coolstreaming	www.coolstreaming.us	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Live HD TV	www.livehdtv.net	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Rossiya Segodnya Group	snanews.de	Liwest Blocklist [32]	German news site
State Duma	duma.gov.ru	OFAC Sanctions list [42]	
Sberbank	www.sber-bank.by	Council Decision 2022/327 [10]	25 February 2022, Not part of Annex IX
	www.sberbank.ru	Council Decision 2022/327 [10]	25 February 2022, Not part of Annex IX
Gazprombank	www.gazprombank.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022, Not part of Annex IX

Methodology (3)

- Policy analysis of public documents analysis from the EU and member states published from 2019 – 2024*
 - EU digital sovereignty documents
 - EU policies and processes that have accompanied the sanction development and implementation.

* Corresponding with the Von der Leyen presidency

Sanctions

1. Sanctions

- Economic
- Diplomatic
- Military
- Sports
- Environment

2. Economic Sanctions are commercial and financial penalties applied against states, group, or individuals

- Trade barriers
- Asset freezes
- Travel bans
- Arms embargoes
- Restrictions on financial transactions

3. Effective / Ineffective

- Elites
- Targeted / Untargeted
- Overcompliance

Preliminary Timeline of Sanctions

Impact on the Internet



Three concepts

a new combination?

- Sanctions
- Digital Sovereignty
- Network Filtering

Sanctions in the Europe Union

- Sanctions in the European Union are proposed by the The High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy
- The High Representative introduces sanctions to the European Council. The European Council consists of government ministers from each EU member state.
- When sanctions are adopted, it is the responsibility of the individual member states to implement the sanctions.
- The European Commission oversees and evaluates the uniform application of sanctions.

European Digital Sovereignty

"In French we say "qui fait la norme, détient le marché": "who makes the standard holds the market". [...] If we want to ensure Europe's technological sovereignty in crucial disruptive sectors such as 5G, batteries, hydrogen or quantum technology, we must occupy the field of standard-setting. We must become standard-makers, and not just standard-takers."

"We were too naive. We were open by default in the belief that things would go our way. But we can't be open at any price."

Thierry Breton – February 2022, Brussels.





Thusfar European
Digital Sovereignty
policy impacts are
'uncertain' at best.

(Clement Perarnaud)



Quick timeline

February 2014 - Russia invaded Ukraine

Annexation of Crimea and illegal military operations in Ukraine's eastern Donbas region by the Russian state.

EU creates two sanctions packages:

- "Council Regulation (EU) No 833/2014 of 31 July 2014 concerning restrictive measures in view of Russia's actions destabilizing the situation in Ukraine"
- "Council Regulation (EU) No 269/2014 of 17 March 2014 concerning restrictive measures in respect of actions undermining or threatening the territorial integrity, sovereignty and independence of Ukraine"

February 2022 - Russia started a full scale invasion attempt of Ukraine.

Updates to the sanction packages

Council Decision 2022/351

“it shall be prohibited for operators to broadcast or to enable, facilitate or otherwise contribute to broadcast, any content by the legal persons, entities or bodies listed in Annex XV, including through transmission or distribution by any means such as cable, satellite, IP-TV, Internet service providers, Internet video-sharing platforms or applications, whether new or pre-installed”

- 
- Caser-Ripolles et al. (2023) qualify this turn as “unprecedented and controversial” and part of strengthening the EU’s geopolitical approach towards disinformation.
 - Helberger and Schulz (2022) argued further that before the start of the war, such a decision would have been considered “unthinkable” at the EU level, in light of its scope (covering both audiovisual and online media), its consequences for freedom of expression and access to information, but also because media regulation (as a cultural competency) had been mainly left to the responsibility of EU member states until this point in time.
 - Indeed, in normal circumstances, “the EU does not have the competence to impose on member states restrictions on the activities of a broadcaster under media law” (Cabrera Blázquez, 2022).
 - Sanctions have become the tool enabling the Commission to give more substance to its geopolitical agenda (Portela, 2024).

Sanctioned organisation	Hostname	Source	Remark/Date added
Russia Today English	www.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Russia Today UK	www.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Russia Today Germany	de.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	deutsch.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Russia Today France	francais.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	fr.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
RT en español	actualidad.rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	actualidad-rt.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
Sputnik	www.sputniknews.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputniknewslv.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputniknews.gr	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputniknews.cn	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	radiosputnik.ria.ru	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	1 March 2022
	sputnikglobe.com	Council Decision 2022/351 [11]	Registered 29 March 2023, sputniknews.com now redirects to this domain name.
Rossiya RTR / RTR Planeta	www.rtr-planeta.com	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
	rtr-planeta.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
	vgtrk.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
Rossiya 24 / Russia 24	www.vesti.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
TV Centre International	www.tvc.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
	tvci.ru	Council Decision 2022/884 [12]	3 June 2022
NTV/NTV Mir	ntv.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
Rossiya 1	smotrim.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
REN TV	ren.tv	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
Pervyi Kanal	1tv.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022
RT Arabic	www.rtarabic.com	Council Decision 2023/434 [13]	25 February 2023
Sputnik Arabic	sputnikarabic.ae	Council Decision 2023/434 [13]	25 February 2023
RT en español mirror	esrt.online	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 8 April 2022
	esrt.press	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 8 April 2022
RT Germany mirror	rtde.site	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 5 March 2022
	rtde.xyz	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 5 March 2022
	rtde.team	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 5 March 2022
	test.rtde.live	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.live	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 6 April 2022
	test.rtde.website	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.tech	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.world	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 6 April 2022
	rtde.me	Liwest Blocklist [32]	Registered 6 April 2022
A-Russia	a-russia.ru	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	Russian TV streaming site
WWITV: World Wide Internet TV	wwitv.com	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
glaz.tv	www.glaz.tv	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Russisches Fernsehen	www.russisches-tv-fernsehen.de	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
On TV Time	ontvtime.tv	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
SPB TV World	spbv.online	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Coolstreaming	www.coolstreaming.us	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Live HD TV	www.livehdv.net	Bundesnetzagentur [6]	TV streaming site
Rossiya Segodnya Group	snanews.de	Liwest Blocklist [32]	German news site
State Duma	duma.gov.ru	OFAC Sanctions list [42]	
Sberbank	www.sber-bank.by	Council Decision 2022/327 [10]	25 February 2022, Not part of Annex IX
	www.sberbank.ru	Council Decision 2022/327 [10]	25 February 2022, Not part of Annex IX
Gazprombank	www.gazprombank.ru	Council Decision 2022/2478 [9]	16 December 2022, Not part of Annex IX

Bohužel / Unfortunately

Přístup na požadovanou internetovou stránku byl zablokován na základě povinností vyplývajících z legislativy České republiky / Evropské unie.

Access to requested website was blocked based on obligations arising from legislation of the Czech Republic / European Union.



Šiuo metu nėra galimybės pasiekti šios svetainės, nes joje buvo nustatyta neteisėtai vykdoma veikla – apie joje vykdomą televizijos programų ir (ar) atskirų programų platinimo internete Lietuvos Respublikos vartotojams veiklą nebuvo pranešta Lietuvos radijo ir televizijos komisijai teisės aktų nustatyta tvarka.

Informaciją apie asmenų, neteisėtai vykdančių televizijos programų ir (ar) atskirų programų platinimo internete Lietuvos Respublikos vartotojams, veiklą galite rasti [čia](#).

Dėl išsamesnės informacijos prašome kreiptis į Lietuvos radijo ir televizijos komisiją,

tel. (8 5) 233 0660, faks. (8 5) 264 7125, e. p. lrtk@rtk.lt.

You have been redirected to this website, because at present there is no access to the website you are trying to reach because of illegal services detected on that website, i.e. the services of the distribution of television programmes and (or) individual programmes on the Internet for the users of the Republic of Lithuania were not notified to the Radio and Television Commission of Lithuania in accordance with the procedure established by legal acts.

Information on the illegal services of the distribution of television programmes and (or) individual programmes on the Internet for the users of the Republic of Lithuania is provided [here](#).

For more information, please contact the Radio and Television Commission of Lithuania,

tel. +370 5 233 0660, fax. +370 5 264 7125, e-mail: lrtk@rtk.lt.



Διαδίκτυο



Τηλεόραση



Κινητή

MAXity

Maxify App



Συσκευές



MyAccount



Επικοινωνία



Η πρόσβαση στο συγκεκριμένο domain έχει προσωρινά ανασταλεί

Ανατρέξτε στον κανονισμό (ΕΕ) 2022/350 του Συμβουλίου σχετικά με περιοριστικά μέτρα ενόψει των ενεργειών της Ρωσίας που αποσταθεροποιούν την κατάσταση στην Ουκρανία

Access to the specific domain has been temporarily suspended

Please refer to Council Regulation (EU) 2022/350 concerning restrictive measures in view of Russia's actions destabilizing the situation in Ukraine

The Executive Board of the RIPE NCC believes that the means to communicate should not be affected by domestic political disputes, international conflicts or war. This includes the provision of correctly registered Internet numbering resources.

The Executive Board of the RIPE NCC is committed to taking all lawful steps available to ensure that the RIPE NCC can provide uninterrupted services to all members across our service region and the global Internet community.

The RIPE NCC will publicly document all its efforts to ensure that the registry is not negatively affected by laws, regulations or political developments.

organisation: ORG-TFGS1-RIPE
org-name: The Federal Guard Service of the Russian Federation
country: RU
org-type: LIR
address: Bolshoi Kiselny per. 4
address: 107031
address: Moscow
address: RUSSIAN FEDERATION
phone: +74956062863
fax-no: +74956060333
e-mail: noc@gov.ru
abuse-c: AR16670-RIPE
mnt-ref: tfgs-mnt
mnt-ref: RIPE-NCC-HM-MNT
mnt-by: RIPE-NCC-HM-MNT
mnt-by: tfgs-mnt
created: 2008-12-30T14:07:36Z
last-modified: 2020-12-16T12:29:29Z
source: RIPE

Conclusions (I) - Sanctions

- Sanctions against Russian entities are inconsistently implemented across the EU;
- Can at least in part be contributed to the high-level and technology neutral description of the sanctions and the lack of recommendations for technical implementation;
- Implementation of the sanctions was largely left to the interpretation of network operators and guidance and interpretation provided by national authorities in EU member states (if any);
- The technical methods used for implementing the blocks are not transparent in most cases;
- End users are not adequately informed that the reason they cannot access the requested resource is due to EU mandated filtering.

Conclusions (II) - Digital Sovereignty

- It is still very easy to find content from Russia Today and Sputnik online, both through mirror sites as well as aggregate sites;
- While these sanctions can be categorised as an economic measure, these sanctions must also be understood in the broader context of recent EU policies tackling online disinformation and foreign interference;
- Diffuse implementation might be basis to say that this had limited impact to increasing the EU's digital sovereignty;
- However, first large online content regulation measure by the EU;
- Evaluation by the Commission might lead to more uniform implementation.

Conclusion (III) - Theoretical Contribution

- Multistakeholder internet governance functions as an ideological state apparatus, guided by an infrastructural ideology to increase interconnection;
- The EU functions as a emerging repressive state apparatus by inscribing its norms, through its territorial power, in a part of the global network of networks, but only does so within its borders and on the content layer;
- A global ideological state apparatus increases interconnection while repressive state apparatuses inscribe their regional norms in a process we call the metagovernance of internet governance.

References

- Casero-Ripollés, A., Tuñón, J. & Bouza-García, L. 2023. The European approach to online disinformation: geopolitical and regulatory dissonance. *Humanit Soc Sci Commun* 10, 657. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-023-02179-8>
- Helberger, N. & Schulz, W. 2022. Understandable, but still wrong: How freedom of communication suffers in the zeal for sanctions. *LSE's Media Blog* : <https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/medialse/2022/06/10/understandable-but-still-wrong-how-freedom-of-communication-suffers-in-the-zeal-for-sanctions/>
- Poli, S., & Finelli, F. 2023. Context specific and structural changes in EU restrictive measures adopted in reaction to Russia's aggression on Ukraine. *Eurojus*.
- Portela, C. 2024. Sanctions and the Geopolitical Commission: The War over Ukraine and the Transformation of EU Governance. *European Papers-A Journal on Law and Integration*, 2023(3), 1125-1130.
- Roch, J. & Oleart, A. 2024. How 'European sovereignty' became mainstream: the geopoliticisation of the EU's 'sovereign turn' by pro-EU executive actors, *Journal of European Integration*, DOI: 10.1080/07036337.2024.2326831
- Ververis, V., Lasota, L., Ermakova, T., & Fabian, B. 2023. Website blocking in the European Union: Network interference from the perspective of Open Internet. *Policy & Internet*, 1–28. <https://doi.org/10.1002/poi3.367>
- Zajácz, Rita. 2019. *Reluctant Power: Networks, Corporations, and the Struggle for Global Governance in the Early 20th Century*. MIT Press.